

תוכן העניינים

דנה אמיר דבר העורכת: על שמיכות טלאים ותקווה יא

מאמרים

- מירב רוט מפונס הזכרן לאגנס השכחנית: על זיכרונות
מתים ושכחות חיות 3
- עמנואל עמרמי שתי פאזות ושלושה פנים של המיניות
בפסיכואנליזה – עם מבט חטוף לאהבה 21
- ענת צור מהלאל 'לכתוב כמו כלב שחופר לעצמו בור, כמו חולדה
שחופרת לעצמה מחילה': נרטיבים של פרידה
מנקודת המבט של מטופלי פרויד 43
- רקפת אפרת (לבקוביץ') הולצר 'אינ־קֶץ לאינ־שׁוֹבֶב': מלנכוליה ושלייה כפולה
תהומית 71
- איילת נאה עצמי זה שאינו אחד: על יחסי השיקוף שבין
העצמי להכרה מבעד לאספקלריה הקבלית 101
- יפעת איתן־פרסיקו על תצורות אדיפליות במשפחות חד־מיניות 127
- עמרי בלום מושג ה'אלביתי' במרחב הספרותי והפסיכואנליטי .. 167
- רות נצר מיתוסים ומציאות על גילוי עריות, חטא וגאולה ... 199
- משה אלון העברה, העברה־נגדית והמטפל הפצוע: פרספקטיבה
יונגיאנית־אנליטית על יחסי מטפל־מטופל 237

257 כינון העצמי	ציקי כהן
279 בעקבות הסרט 'צבים יכולים לעוף'	אלינה שלקס
299 מרים ילן-שטקליס המסע אל האי אולי	דפנה בן צבי

מסות

327 הקבוע והמשתנה	ענת פלגי-הקר
341 התייחסותית	חנה אולמן
365 Story-Case: סוד הטקסט הפסיכואנליטי	חגית אהרוני

עיונים במאמר מתורגם

387 החידה שבמיניות	רות שטיין
411 חידת המיניות – חידת הידידות	רינה לזר
421 ההיזק ושולי הסכנה	רות קרא איונוב-קניאל
433 הדתית	ביטי רואי
445	הוראות למחברים
451	המשתתפים
XV	תקצירים באנגלית

דבר העורכת: על שמיכות טלאים ותקווה

דנה אמיר

בנאומו לרגל קבלת פרס העיר ברמן לספרות (1958) כתב המשורר פאול צלאן:

כי השיר אינו חסר זמן. כן, הוא טוען לאינסופיות, מבקש לשלוח ידו דרך הזמן והלאה – אבל דרך הזמן, לא מתוך עקיפת הזמן. השיר, אפשר שהוא דואר-בקבוק הנשלח מתוך האמונה כי אי-שם ואי-מתי יישטף אל היבשה, אולי אל יבשת הלב. שירים שרויים אף הם מבחינה זו בדרך: הם הולכים אל משהו. אל מה? אל משהו העומד פתוח, פנוי, אולי אל "אתה" שאפשר לדבר אליו, אל מציאות שאפשר לדבר אליה. מציאויות כאלה, כך אני סבור, הן-הן עניינו של השיר. אלה הם מאמציו של מי שלראשו טסים כוכבים מעשה ידי אדם, והוא חסר קורת גג ומתוך כך מופקר עד אימה במרחב הפתוח – מי שהולך עם הווייתו אל השפה, פצוע מציאות, מבקש מציאות.¹

הכתיבה הפסיכואנליטית, כמו השירה, שרויה תמיד בדרך. במובן זה הטלאים השונים המרכיבים את שמיכת הטלאים הגדולה שלה גם הם סוגים שונים של "דואר-בקבוק", כפי שכינה צלאן את שיריו, הנשלחים הרחק מעבר לנסיבות הכאן והעכשיו שבהן נוצרו. כל טלאי כזה הוא מכתב אישי מאוד שנשלח אל נמען עלום ("אל" אתה' שאפשר לדבר אליו") ועתיד לחצות בתוך מסעו מקומות וזמנים. מארג, כשמו כן הוא: מארג של שפות. כתב העת הזה, שנוסד בידי פרופ' משה הלוי ספירו ששימש כעורך הראשי של שמונה הגיליונות הראשונים שלו ומובל מאז ועד היום בידיו הנאמנות של פרופ' גבי שפלר כיושב ראש המערכת, היה מלכתחילה ניסיון לחבר זה לזה, במלאכת מחשבת של איחוי, טלאים שונים. כל טלאי ייצג ניב פסיכואנליטי שונה. כל טלאי האיר את השדה הפסיכואנליטי הקליני והתיאורטי באור

1 בתוך: פאול צלאן (1994). סורג שפה, תרגום: שמעון זנרבנק. תל אביב: הקיבוץ המאוחד, הספרייה החדשה לשירה, עמ' 125-126.

שונה ומעמדת תצפית אחרת. אפשר לחשוב על המארג הכולל של הטלאים האלה כעל שמיכת טלאים (קווילט). אף שכל טלאי עומד בפני עצמו, האפקט הרחב, המתמשך, נובע דווקא מן החיבור שלהם זה לזה. אפשר לחשוב גם על נמשלים שונים לטלאי הפסיכואנליטי: טלאים יכולים לייצג גישות תיאורטיות שונות, כלומר צורות "חיתוך" שונות של העוגה (והעגה) הפסיכואנליטית, אך יכולים לייצג גם ממשקים שונים של הפסיכואנליזה עם תחומי דעת אחרים: ספרות, פילוסופיה, הגות.

הגיליון הנוכחי מאחד, כפי שתראו, מאמרים שהוגשו למערכת בשנים 2019-2020. מבנהו יהיה שונה מעתה ממבנה הגיליונות הקודמים. חלקן הראשון של כל גיליון יכלול מאמרים פסיכואנליטיים, חלקו השני יכלול מסות, שהן "טלאים" מסוג אחר, המאפשר כתיבה פסיכואנליטית יותר חופשית ואישית, ואילו חלקו השלישי של כל גיליון יוקדש למאמר קנוני נבחר שיתורגם לעברית – ואותו יקיפו, כדף גמרא, דיוניהם של כותבים ישראלים.

שמיכת הטלאים הזאת, החוברת לשמיכות הטלאים שקדמו לה, הווה אומר לגיליונות הקודמים של כתב העת, היא בה בעת עגינה במקום ובזמן – וגם רפסודה שעתידה לחרוג, מעצם מהותה, ממגבלות ההווה המקומי והזמני. אני רואה במלאכת האריגה הזאת מעשה של נחמה והשראה, תקווה גדולה למרחבים שישובו ויפתחו, ולזמנים שעוד יבואו.

תשרי תשפ"א

THE ENIGMATIC DIMENSION OF SEXUAL EXPERIENCE

RUTH STEIN

At the heart of this paper stands the enigma of sexuality and the presence of an “enigmatic Other” who is being carried over, in some mental form or another, into adult life where it constitutes a bedrock for the sense of mystery and of the unfathomable in every intimate attachment to an other. Beginning with Freud’s (1856-1939) and Jean Laplanche’s (1924-2012) theories of primal seduction, the author stresses the role of the (m)other, who sends or radiates “enigmatic signifiers,” messages about her sexuality, to the child whom she nurtures.

Stein claims that sexual experience has an inherent quality of “otherness” to it that distinguishes it from daily, habitual modes of experience (until, of course, these become aligned with sexuality). Sexuality plays many roles in formation of the self, as she states:

As the opportunity for abandonment of the self, for immersing ourselves in the other, thereby intensifying the sense of self and of connecting with the other, and for the power it has to consolidate or protect the self or release the “true self” ...People seek sexual experience in an attempt to reconstruct and heal trauma, to achieve affirmation and recognition, to populate one's inner world and charge one's inner objects with excitement and vitality or even to bolster a collapsing or fragmenting self.

In the article presented here, Stein adds a new understanding of the non-symmetrical and the un-mutual qualities of recognition that emerge between loving partners and the ways in which these imitate the primal pattern of mother and baby relationship.

According to Stein, the mother’s ministrations provoke the baby’s erotic sensations, which in turn arouse the mother’s sense of pleasure and desire (even when these are unconscious to herself). She states:

The enigma lies in the hidden fact that early relationships are sexual, and that sexuality itself is something that is characteristically known

and not known, and even if already known, can still perplex and retain the power of an enigma.

Furthermore, Stein articulates the links between early sexuality and the enigmatic message with different forms of transference and countertransference, to offer new possibilities of understanding various clinical phenomena within the analytic process. Stein's approach to eroticism is embedded in the French psychoanalytic tradition, which has not ceased reflecting upon and investigating the erotic in psychoanalysis, in contrast to Anglo-American psychoanalysis that has tended toward displacing sexuality toward drives or object relations.

Stein claims that the line between a loving, dedicated psychotherapeutic treatment and a harmful, offensive one is diminutive, reflecting basically the two faces of the original primal 'treatment.' In her words:

The passage, or transference, from the nutritive to the erotic and from the excited body to the mystifying other, as well as the view of mother's sexuality as comprising that of her husband or partner and its dwelling in an inner world populated by diverse inner objects, all these combine to make, in my view, sexual object relations primordially and intrinsically transferential

Indeed, the concluding part of her paper contributes to the understanding of the broader analytic process, and specifically the erotic dimension in transference and countertransference. Stein claims that the psychoanalyst should be aware not only of the "configurations of transferentially reconstructed fragments of situations of infantile erotic awakenings through mother's transmission," but also the way in which sexuality is embedded in the physiological-bodily dimension, by the presence of the body in the clinical situation.

In order to explore the experience of awakening and creative mystery that the analyst evokes in his patient, Stein deduces the idea that

the patient's sense of the uncontrollability of erotic feelings may sometimes be reinforced by the analyst's attitude that defends against intense feelings toward the patient, whether they are directly aroused by the latter or not. Such defensiveness may produce an overly rigid attitude that contributes to mystifying the patient and strengthening his or her erotic longings and to sexualization as a desperate attempt to get closer to the frustrating, opaque analyst.

It is clear that with these words Stein is relying upon Relational and Inter-subjective psychoanalytic theories that supplement and enrich the French

psychoanalytic school of thought. For example, she uses Irwin Z. Hoffman's (1950-) relational and social-constructivist position, with its strong emphasis on mutual constructions of reality for both participants, and which focuses on the impact of the nontransparency of the analyst to himself/herself. Her discussion of the unconscious message which the analyst may transmit to the analysand is based also upon Jody Davies' (1950-) and Jessica Benjamin's (1967-) clinical ideas and ramifications. She quotes Davies as saying, "an organization of the experiences of self in relation to another in which love, shame, idealization, envy, and rage are not just words but systems of physical sensation, elusive, ever-shifting, and rarely, if ever, verbalized in interpersonal normal discourse." At the same time, Stein expands and evolves these ideas regarding erotic countertransference, since "it always encompasses the combination of the other and the bodily aspects, a combination one has to be aware of, experience, and use for analytic purposes."

Referring to Julia Kristeva's (1941-) poetic testimonial question that a mother might have concerning her infant or one lover might have of his or her lover – "What value has my desire for you?" – Stein interpolates that the same question has to be asked within the analytic dyad. Stein adds that a patient's sensitivity to the analyst's personality and unconscious, and to what the analyst wants from the patient, arouses the patient's transference need to be a therapist to the therapist, repeating this basic infantile relationship with parents – that ancient sensitivity to any kind of excess that is similar to what the sexual part of the mother may have had toward her child – and may use this modus to create a false self that adapts to the expectations of others, including the psychotherapist.

Finally, Stein draws concealed relations and associations between the poignant and enigmatic sexuality and the realm of revelation, and the desire to know the "mystifying [M]other." By developing Laplanche's well-known statement that "sexuality [from the start] is the perversion of the functional," Stein claims that autoerotism is a state in which the milk *qua* "object of function" has been lost, such that the substitute objects of the sexual drive becomes a "phantasmatic" sexual breast. The concatenated figure of the mythological Sphinx represents an emblem of motherly enigma joining with sexual seduction and life beginning.

The Sphinx may be seen as a hyperbolic, allegorical rendition of the "phantasmatic" object that has been substituted for the original, familiar, and nutritive object, an uncanny object that confronts the infant and the preoedipal child's distress at having to accomplish the arduous

mental work of translating the enigma into a solution of its own.

By so saying, the creative process of imagination and fantasy are shown as capable of being used in order to resolve the primordial riddle and the enigma of the “primal scene.”

The enigma that is here created lies in the (hidden) fact that early relationships are sexual, and that sexuality itself is something that is characteristically known and not known, and even if already known, can still perplex and retain the power of an enigma.

Human sexuality is based on mother’s temptation and enigmatic message to the infant, as a fundamental experience that reflects the growth of the self in a non-symmetrical and un-mutual environment. This mysterious experience is embedded in recognition of object loss, object displacement and object refinding, which is eternally, as Freud stated clearly (1905, p. 222), a *refinding* of an object other than the original – “the displaced and never identically attainable object has a crucial role to play in the inception of sexuality.” Thus, according to Stein, sexuality is an endless quest and mission built upon dependence and reliance upon the other, and hence a profound vulnerability, which is a condition of erotic concealment and revelation.

Sexual object relation does not involve symmetry or maximal identification with the other all the time, but only at moments. More precisely, erotic mutuality depends on some form of non-mutuality and on areas where the other is revealed as well as on areas where he or she is not found and where there is a kind of “separated” experience where the other is hidden. There is the desire to uncover the other, and the reaching for achievement of deep mutuality in eroticism is a wonderful dimension of sexuality.

**THE ENIGMA OF SEXUALITY –
THE ENIGMA OF FRIENDSHIP**

RINA LAZAR

I wish to offer some comments regarding the heretofore unpublished essay by the late psychoanalyst Ruth Stein, entitled “The enigma of sexuality.” These are mainly personal thoughts regarding the riddle of friendship in general, and the riddles of my friendship with Ruth Stein in particular. I will attempt to connect Stein’s prolific works about sexuality – which focus on its enigmatic, inherently other and excessive dimensions – with her way of *being* in life as an outstanding psychoanalytic thinker, and with her way of being with those she befriended.

I begin by referring to Stein’s writing in general and especially to her elaboration of the dimension of *excess* – the central theme of the present article as well as so many others – and attempt to align this with the unique *striving for transition* that characterized Stein’s writing and being. I refer to Ruth Stein as a soul mate as I struggle to understand friendship, our friendship, our alliance, its history and its upheavals.

In her final article about “The otherness of sexuality: Excess,” (2008) Stein wrote, “Excess is an ‘antithetical,’ self-contradictory term that denotes both liberated pleasure beyond bounds, and abominable transgression and destructiveness” (p. 43). In another paper of hers, “The enigmatic dimension of sexual experience: The otherness of sexuality and primal seduction” (1998), Stein elaborated upon Georges Bataille’s ideas (1897-1962) and expatiates on the human longing for a sort of seamless and uninterrupted discontinuity, the blending of differences, the death of singularity, a disruption of established order, a violation of the taboo that protects the individual’s privacy and distinct individuality. The plenipotentiality of sexuality, according to Stein, does not come from crossing borders and abolishing separateness, but rather from the *very conception of such a possibility* which then enables one to look with the other human being into the abyss that lies between them, as they feel together the dizziness that accrues from their joint looking. As well, death in eroticism is not ‘death’ in the concrete sense, but rather in the sense of the destruction of the sense of continuous being, which itself represents a deeply regressive and transcendental wish to let go, a desire to go keeling helplessly over what

assails the innermost depths of every human being. This desire to give one's self up is at the same time a desire to live to the limits of the possible and the impossible with ever-increasing intensity; the desire to live while ceasing to live, or to die without ceasing to live.

My efforts here portray Stein's thought and way of being in the light of these ideas, and I then try to connect these to my own thoughts regarding friendship, based on the work *Friendship* (1971[1997]) by French philosopher and literary theorist Maurice Blanchot (1907-2003) and *Siblings: Sex and Violence* (2003) by British psychoanalyst and feminist Juliet Mitchell (1940-). In this essay, I try to share the flavor of Stein's way of being in dialogue with anyone with whom she spoke and exposed her ideas, be it a friend, a colleague or an audience of hundreds of people. Stein's manner was erotic and excessive, both lucid and enigmatic, dialogic and deconstructive and always empowering to her listeners and friends. Put simply, she was the best conversant you could wish for. In Blanchot's words, "This is thought's profound grief: it must accompany friendship into oblivion" (Blanchot, 1971, p. 292).

**THE NEGATIVE OF THE ENIGMA
AND THE PROFANATION OF OTHERNESS:
ON POSITIVE GROWTH AND DESTRUCTIVE ELEMENTS
WITHIN THE HUMAN-DIVINE RELATION AND
MATERNAL SEDUCTION**

RUTH KARA IVANOV-KANIEL

This paper expands upon Ruth Stein's conception of maternal primal seduction and modes of relatedness in relation to the divine. Stein's thesis is that within the mother's maternal role of caring and nurturing her infant, the mother simultaneously seduces her child and expresses erotic affection toward him, which establishes the foundation for his own desires and mature sexuality. In the same manner, I would argue, God, who brings the human individual into existence and cares for him or her through direct and indirect providence, must also seduce the human being. This lens allows for an exploration of the human relation with the absolute Other, explicating both the potential positive growth entailed within this relationship – i.e., as a reflection of maternal and earthly desire – and the potentially destructive element implicit within the human-divine relation.

In her paper, Stein emphasized that the basis for mature sexuality is based on the recognition of "otherness." The enigmatic and erotic dimensions of such otherness reflect hidden and inner expanses in which an individual cannot ever fully be cognizant of themselves – let alone their partner(s). The foundation of sexual experience, thus, is based on the differentiation between the mother and her infant and the "primal seduction" that transpires in this unequal and asymmetrical dyad. The riddle of the other is never solved. Nevertheless, mature sexuality allows each partner to disclose themselves within a structure that resonates throughout transpersonal and religious experiences of revelation, mystical union, surrender, and spiritual assimilation. Just as is the case in the archetypal mother-infant relationships, so too in processes of faith and encountering the irreducible, wholly Other there is an asymmetrical space – a chasm – that serves as the basis for attachment to the enigmatic other that always remains unknowable.

Jacob Frank (1726–1791) and the Frankist movement will serve as the

case study for our exploration of the abovementioned concept.¹⁹ Through this charismatic personality and his messianic movement, structures of abuse, sexual harassment, and exploitation will be investigated. These occurrences took place frequently within his circles – forming the very foundation of the communal society (*ahyah*) that Jacob Frank established in eighteenth-century Poland. Frank referred to the male members of the commune as *brothers* and the female members of the commune as *sisters*, thus implying his role as supernal father of *all* the members – brothers and sisters – of his movement, with whom he carried on sexual relationships. As a messianic sovereign, Frank believed that he embodied the supreme and even divine power to rule and command his circle of disciples. There is even speculation regarding incestuous relations between Frank and his daughter Eva (1754–1816), who was chosen by him to fulfill the redemptive role of “Holy Mistress” (*alma go’elet*), and later serve as the mystic cult leader. Even if Frank did not commit incest with his daughter, and Eva stayed a virgin until her death, she was abused by her father in a variety of quasi-symbolic manners – alongside many other young women, whom he oppressed, exploited, raped, and forced to participate in orgiastic rituals in which, as the personification of the divine on earth, he allowed himself to partake. He would even suckle at the breasts of nursing mothers – imbibing the nurturing breast milk for himself.

Against this backdrop, I argue that in messianic sectarian movements a special kind of exploitation and perversion is created and developed. Jacob Frank used his power in order to transgress the demarcation of privacy and dispossess the other of his or her own space. Frank, similar to past and contemporary charismatic and manipulative leaders, deliberately employed ambiguous kabbalistic terminology which intertwined conceptions of transgression and redemption in order to control the other and devour their interiority and agency. Thus, within this movement, Frank created a “confusion of tongues” in a double sense: first, on a human-to-human horizontal level –

19 [Ed. Note – MHS] Jacob Joseph Frank, born Jakub Lejbowicz, was an 18th-century Polish-Jewish religious leader, originally a merchant, who claimed to be the reincarnation of the self-proclaimed messiah Shabbatai Zvi (1626–1676) and also of the biblical patriarch Jacob. Frank’s father had been a Sabbatean. The rabbinical authorities in Poland excommunicated Jacob Frank and his followers due to his heretical doctrines that included elements of Christian thought, and culminated in his self-deification as a part of the trinity, and other controversial concepts such as neo-Carpocratian “purification through transgression.” The Frankists were viewed as anti-talmudists, and embraced the Zohar within whose obscure, mystical concepts and protean mixtures of feminine and masculine symbolisms they found room to fit their Trinitarian beliefs. In 1759, many Frankists followed Jacob Frank’s orders to be baptized into Christianity.

an organization that Sándor Ferenczi (1873-1933) described in his landmark 1949 paper as a mixture between an adult's language of passion and a child's language of tenderness – and, second, on a human-to-divine vertical level, the sphere of relations between the Godhead and human beings, in which the dimension of sanctity was converted by Frank into a space of persecution, punishment, and self-annihilation.

When otherness is consumed within identity, the enigmatic chasm between self and other collapses and sexuality and primal seduction become tools of manipulation and destruction. The charismatic messianic leader, who acts as an intermediary between the divine and human, instead of embodying the always remaining gap between self and other, ultimately displaces God, leading to the profanation of the sacred and the reduction of otherness.

In addition to my conclusions regarding the destructive potentialities involved in mystical unification and messianic movements, I take the opportunity to contrast this with the possibility of constructive attachment to a positive “mystifying (m)other.” In mythical imagery, such as the eating of manna, the concealing of the primordial light, and the breathing of life into the human being in the Garden of Eden, a passionate relationship with the other is reflected, and religious experience and the dimension of faith is based on boundaries that are not transgressed, but protected. Religious revelation, especially mystical experience, as already noted by Jean Laplanche (1924-2012), Georges Bataille (1897-1962), and others, may be interpreted as forms of constructive growth, Eros and desire that are directed toward God, on the one hand; or as pathological illness, paranoia, hallucinations, and dangerous misuses of power, on the other hand. The wish to unite with the absolute and become one with divinity, referred to in religious studies as *unio mystica*, is situated at the heart of mystical literature and experience. Since primal seduction occurs between two unequal partners, there is always the danger of perversion, trauma, exploitation, and abuse in the interaction between mother and infant – God and human being.

**HUMAN, AND ALL TOO HUMAN:
DESIRE, ENIGMA AND RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE**

BITI ROI

In this essay regarding the work of Ruth Stein, I take as my point of intersect the resemblance between the mother-infant dyad and human-Divine relations, which in their centers lie the enigma, a crucial, indecipherable riddle that deals with the secret of life. As I see matters, the enigmatic message not only constitutes the adulterated sexual experience, but also characterizes the religious realm, with inherently sublime transformations between the corporal-sensual, the erotic-sexual and the spiritual-divine. At the heart of both the maternal and the religious experience stands what I term a “transfer object” that serves as a yearning point that, as such experiences develop, slowly reveals itself from under its covers.

In addition, I deal with the *implementations* of the “divine desire” – what God desires, as it were – and seek to illuminate its features in Jewish tradition, from the time of the Sages in late antiquity to the origins of the mystical tradition in the Kabbalah and later Hassidism. As opposed to the threatening, commanding, castrating God image, in the latter literature there immerses a feminine divine, loving and passionate God, similar to that of the mother in infancy. At the heart of the relationship between the divine, the world and the human stems a huge passion that has no rational justification nor functional reason but itself. This depiction emphasizes the strength of this passion and defines it as a major pole for the world, explaining the creation of all life in this world, its essence and meaning.

With the awareness of the danger represented by the perverted, depraved tensions that religious subjugation can evoke, this article articulates the religious enigmatic arena as an acknowledgement of the fact that the world is full of freedom and creativity that enables a shift from the corporal to the spiritual, from reality to the phantasmatic, from believing to doubt, and from the alienated to the close and well-known.

The article criticizes the patriarchal approach which derives from the classical oedipal model, which had served as the basis for the psychoanalytic approach to understanding religious terror, and suggests adopting a maternal model of passionate feminine divinity of nourishment, whose internalization

would better serve to encourage hope and to mitigate the God who needs to be pacified and appeased. This precise model exists in the heart of many Jewish mystical traditions.