

תוכן העניינים

דנה אמיר דבר העורכת יא

מאמרים

- גד בן־שפר החיפוש אחר האמת בעולם משתנה: בורחס, פוסטמודרניזם והטיפול הפסיכואנליטי 3
- רונית לזר פרוורסיה: מעשה בטראומה ותקווה 17
- רות גת־דוכרוב ממכאובי הערך העצמי אל עצמיות כקיום שלם 53
- אילנה לח פני הרוע: מופעיו של הצל הארכיטיפי במיתולוגיה ובנפש האדם 73
- עפרית שפירא־ברמן כשגוף פוגש שפה וזו יוצרת רוח: נשים ערביות־ישראליות על גילוי עריות שעברו בילדות מבט פסיכואנליטי על מחקר איכותני 93
- טוביה פרי, מיטשל בקר ובעז שלגי מגדל בבל: ממדורת השבט אל כור ההיתוך ובחזרה 123
- נורית דרוזן בר כשאנקוויסט ובאך פוגשים את אוגדן: מילים וצלילים בשרעפי ה־reverie כתהליכים של התמודדות עם אובדן ועיבוד אבל 147

מסות

177	”תראי אותי!” – “אל תראי אותי!”: בקשתו כפולת הפנים של המטופל	מירב רוט
191	פיצול האני: סיפור של מבנה	מיכאל סידני-לוי
213	מפגש נפשות: מחשבות על נפש האדם בעקבות לו ארון ולזכרו	רינה לזר
231	”ירח מר”: טרנספורמציות של דחף החיים ודחף המוות בפרוורסיה	מיכאל ובתיה שושני
255	אננקה: מסה על החריגה	יותם חותם

לזכר

281	גבי שפּלר, דברים לזכרו של חזי כהן	
283	הוראות למחברים	
289	המשתתפים	
xi	תקצירים באנגלית	

דבר העורכת: לראות דרך כל דמעותינו

דנה אמיר

"עין יבשה יכולה לראות הכל – אך לא לראות היטב. כדי להיטיב ראות אנו זקוקים לכל דמעותינו", כותב דידי הוברמן.¹ המילים האלה אוחזות במשהו מן הייחוד של הכתיבה הפסיכואנליטית בכלל, ושל המאמרים והמסות המופיעים בגיליון הנוכחי של מארג בפרט.

בשונה מן הכתיבה העיונית הרווחת, המקדשת במוכנים רבים את היכולת להביט "בעין יבשה" ומתוך ריחוק אסתטי – מלאכת הכתיבה הפסיכואנליטית העיונית-מסאית, שבאה לידי ביטוי מגוון בכל חלקי הגיליון הזה, עושה שימוש באפשרות אחרת: להתבונן באמצעות הדמעה ודרכה. הדמעה, בהקשר הזה, איננה סוג של מיסוך החוצץ בין הרואה והנראה – אלא צורה של חיבור צלול מאין כמוהו ביניהם. בתוך החיבור הזה, כפי שנראה, המבט אינו נשלח מן העצמי אל האחר או מן הפנים אל החוץ, בבחינת פעולה שיש לה כיוונית אחת – אלא חוצה את המרחב לאורך ולרוחב, פונה קדימה ושב לאחור, עד שבסופו של עניין הוא הופך, כשלעצמו, לשדה דינמי עשיר ומתנועע.

כל אחד מן החיבורים המופיעים כאן הוא גילום ייחודי, חד-פעמי, של השדה הזה, וכולם יחד יוצרים מניפה צבעונית של מחשבה פסיכואנליטית מקורית וחיה.

בימים שבהם ניטשים צללים כבדים על העולם – ימים שבהם המחשבה היא נתיב המילוט היקר ביותר, אולי היחיד, העומד לרשותנו – אני מאחלת לקהל הקוראים והקוראות של מארג שעות של נחת רוח, רוחב אופקים ולב.

חורף תשפ"ג

Huberman, D. G. (2002). *Ninfa moderna: essai sur le drape tomb*. Paris: Gallimard: 127

CONTENTS

EDITOR'S INTRODUCTION

Dana Amir	87
-----------------	----

ARTICLES

FINDING TRUTH IN AN UNCERTAIN WORLD: BORGES, POST-MODERNISM, AND PSYCHOANALYTIC TREATMENT

Gad Ben-Shefer	3
----------------------	---

A TALE OF TRAUMA AND HOPE

Ronit Lazar	17
-------------------	----

FROM THE PAINS OF SELF-ESTEEM TO SELFHOOD AS COMPLETE EXISTENCE

Ruth Gat-Dubrov	53
-----------------------	----

THE FACES OF EVIL: MANIFESTATIONS OF THE ARCHETYPAL SHADOW IN MYTH AND PSYCHOTHERAPY

Elana Lakh	73
------------------	----

WHEN BODY MEETS LANGUAGE, CREATING THE SPIRIT: ARAB-ISRAELI WOMEN TALK ABOUT INCEST: A PSYCHOANALYTIC VIEW OF QUALITATIVE RESEARCH

Ofrif Shapira-Berman	93
----------------------------	----

THE TOWER OF BABEL: FROM THE TRIBAL BONFIRE TO THE MELTING POT AND BACK

Tuvia Peri, Mitchel Becker and Boaz Shalgi	123
--	-----

AS ENQUIST AND BACH MEET OGDEN: WORDS AND SOUNDS IN REVERIE'S WANDERING AS THE ART OF COPING WITH LOSS AND MOURNING

Nurit Doron Bar	147
-----------------------	-----

ESSAYS

SEE ME! DON'T SEE ME! – ILLUSIONS OF THE PATIENT'S FACE IN THE MIRROR OF PROJECTIVE IDENTIFICATION	
Merav Roth	177
THE SPLITTING OF THE EGO AND THE INTERNAL DIALOGUE DIMENSION IN FREUD'S LATER WORKS	
Michael Sidi-Levi	191
A MEETING OF MINDS: THOUGHTS ABOUT THE HUMAN MIND FOLLOWING LEW ARON AND IN HONOR OF HIS MEMORY	
Rina Lazar	213
"NO ONE CAN HATE YOU MORE THAN I DO": THE PERVERSE INTERPLAY OF LIFE AND DEATH DRIVES IN ROMAN POLANSKI'S FILM "BITTER MOON"	
Michael and Batia Shoshani	231
ANANKE: AN ESSAY ON TRANSGRESSION	
Yotam Hotam	255

IN MEMORIAM

IN MEMORY OF CHEZI COHEN	
Gabi Shefler	281
INSTRUCTIONS FOR AUTHORS	283
CONTRIBUTORS IN THIS VOLUME	289

**FINDING TRUTH IN AN UNCERTAIN WORLD:
BORGES, POST-MODERNISM AND
PSYCHOANALYTIC TREATMENT**

GAD BEN-SHEFER

We live in postmodern times, but it seems that many of us, scientists as well as laypersons, still find it difficult to fully embrace postmodern thinking and, moreover, *to act* accordingly – especially during the psychoanalytic encounter (Govrin, 2006). The great shifts in the traditional ways of comprehending relativity and contextuality, the critique of linear causality, self-questioning, truth as constantly created and changing, the plurality of perspectives – each of these new paradigm shifts seems to exact a toll, pushing us back and out of our contemporary times in a ‘regressive’ pull towards modernity, in search of a unified perspective and a solid truth upon which one could rely (Yadlin-Gadot, 2017).

My analysis seeks a stable point of anchorage amidst the swirling waves of the postmodern age in order to argue that some postmodern notions offer a more accurate view of the reality of psychoanalytic treatment – both today and in the past. I demonstrate this conflict by discussing two detective stories that serve as clinical vignettes of sorts. The first is a trilogy written by Edgar Allan Poe in the mid-19th century (1833-1841) centering on the detective C. Auguste Dupin, a character depicting the modern spirit of his day, and the detective literature genre in general. The second is a short detective story by Jorge Luis Borges called “Death and the Compass” (1942), that follows the protagonist Erik Lonrot, who may be perceived as Dupin’s postmodern mirror image.

In each of the stories the assortment of details that seem at times chaotic and meaningless, crystallizes into a coherent and meaningful whole that was hidden from everyone’s eyes. The plot moves towards this solution that eases tension and restores order, in the ways classical Freudian psychoanalytic treatment conceived it. The solution rests on the traces left by what had originally disrupted the order. Traces are part of a deterministic system that leaves no room for coincidence. Dupin, who maintains a detached and

intellectual stance, lives in a world where truth exists and is accessible, where reason is power, and rationality and knowledge pave the way to freedom.

In contradistinction to the modernist spirit of Poe's stories – – that specifically seeks certain truth – I then present Borge's story, representative of the postmodern detective story genre. This story explicitly alludes to Poe's Dupin but portrays Borges's Lonrot as a postmodern twin in a plot that casts modernistic tenets as illusory and postmodern ones as more authentically representing reality.

Borges presents us with a world in which chaos and coincidence abound. The order we seem to discover is nothing more than the order we ourselves create while seeking it. It is the order of our consciousness. The detective who faces the mystery in this story is not a cool, external observer. Rather, his interpretations not only describe reality, they create it. The murderer he is after responds to his interpretations, interprets the detective in return, and soon transforms from hunted to hunter, placing the detective in the position of victim.

Borges creates a detective character that seeks rationality while remaining oblivious to his own motives and to the fact that he participates in what is happening. It is precisely the attempt to impose a certain order on reality, and the difficulty accepting coincidence that exists in the reality encountered, that eventually results in Lonrot's death.

Through these stories, and by drawing analogies to the analytic session, I defend the view that a postmodern psychoanalysis is much closer to the reality created in the analytic encounter and that its tenets facilitate a more dis-illusioned understanding of what takes place therein. I portray a psychoanalysis that is not an attack on truth, but a longer, yet faster, way of coming to experience and know truth.

PERVERSION: A TALE OF TRAUMA AND HOPE

RONIT LAZAR

What does perversion tell us? In this article I trace the development of the perversion and I try to understand its role in psychic life as presented in the psychoanalytic literature and as revealed in my clinical practice. The theoretical discussion of perversion is accompanied by the story of ‘Leah’, my analytic patient for over a decade, who from childhood developed various forms of perversion in order to deal with the trauma of the absence of the primordial object.

The essay opens with a comprehensive theoretical review of the major theorists who have contributed to the understanding of perversion. Sigmund Freud (1905, 1927), in his references to fetishism and sadomasochism, viewed these as concretizations of the failure to overcome the castration complex. Neo-Freudians like Joyce McDougall (1989) and Janine Chasseguet-Smirgel (1981, 1988) further emphasized the denial of an earlier narcissistic castration that allows the pervert to evade Oedipal reality. Kleinians such as Donald Meltzer (1973) and Herbert Rosenfeld (1971) saw perversion as a product of failure to split and integrate the great psychic impulses. Theorists associated with Donald Woods Winnicott, such as M. Masud R. Khan (1979) and Ofra Eshel (2004), see in perversion a reconstruction of the trauma in the early mother-infant relationship and a failed attempt by the self to rehabilitate it. Emmanuel Ghent (1990), in the framework of the Relational frame of conception, interprets sadomasochism as a distortion of a longing for recognition and devotion to others. Dana Amir (2012, 2013), researcher of the languages of the mind, calls the pervert’s mode of language “the language of the chameleon,” a language of survival that seduces by adopting the other’s discourse qualities, not in order to create love and intimacy, but rather to intrude and enslave it. Finally, I review the work of recent theorists who focused their research on the interaction of transference and countertransference when treating the perverted patient, such as Betty Joseph (1982), Thomas Ogden (1996), Ruth Stein (2005), and Yedidah Turknich (2011).

I propose that we are best guided by viewing perversion and its treatment binocularly, seeing at once both trauma and hope. I suggest that perversion

embodies both the restoration of an initial trauma and simultaneously the hope and longing for the revival and regaining of the lost object. Viewed in this manner, the pervert holds within him/herself hope for the rehabilitation of the self; hope and belief that there is an object out there somewhere that can redeem him/her.

In kind, I present the psychoanalytic treatment of perversion as an arduous journey that simultaneously takes two contradictory, yet equivalent paths. The first path is the clinical struggle with the perversion itself that has infiltrated the therapeutic situation and seeks to subvert and block the existence of a healthier mental process at every turn. Gradually, it becomes clear that without traversing this path, the depth of the experience of the trauma, and its effects on the psyche, cannot be truly understood. The second path follows the therapeutic regression of the primary mental areas affected by the initial trauma, and subsequently distorted by the perversion, in order to revive and rehabilitate these areas, to enable the self to become and thrive. I suggest that these two paths, the path of perversion and the path of regression, as they appear and take form in therapy separately and together, serve as beacons for the analytic psychotherapist as s/he navigates the agonizing road of the therapeutic process; beacons that enable her/him to be a torch-bearer of hope, strengthening the faith in his/her ability to enable the patient, and him/herself, to emerge from the perverse character trap alive – physically and emotionally.

I illustrate these ideas through the analysis of ‘Leah’, a woman who presented a sadomasochistic clinical picture, and with whom I met for intensive treatment three-to-four times a week for over a decade. In discussing the key developments in the analysis, a connection emerges between the formation of the perversion, its appearance in various forms, and the traumas that occurred in Leah’s early childhood. Primarily, we focused upon traumas in the initial parent-infant relationship involving experiences of abandonment and premature separation, of alienation and emotional absence that began from the beginning of life when the self had not yet become established and formed a coalescent whole. In her case, trauma left traces of holes in the psyche, taking form as a sort of emotional death of a self whose development was nipped in the bud. At the same time, we witnessed a stubborn and unyielding search for primordial passion and intense longing for love, holding and recognition albeit through sadomasochistic attachment and identification with the absent object.

I offer the observation that traumatic experiences and the mental disasters that follow them, as well as the hope and longing for the lost or inadequate

object, take form in a barren and distorted way in the various forms of sadomasochistic perversion. I then discuss the various pathways of the therapeutic process. Perversion infiltrated this process via reconstruction and resuscitation of sado-masochistic relationships between the patient and the therapist, especially in the form of virtual ritual enactments.

I am keen to describe the path of regression. My approach follows the spirit of Winnicott's (1954) *regression to dependence*, which relates to therapeutic regression being a new opportunity for self-formation, through an experiential return to the place where traumas, due to the initial failure in the mother-infant relationship, initially occurred. The clinical regression resuscitates those primordial mental areas of psychic life – largely pre-verbal – which are then camouflaged and later distorted by perversion. I emphasize the clinical interventions that were based on holding and responding to needs, as Winnicott suggested, and then integrated with interpretations that Naama Keinan (2014) refers to as “psychic envelope interpretations”, inspired by Didier Anzieu's (1995) concept of the psychic envelope. That is to say, holding-type interpretations provide the sensory experience of continuity of existence, enabling an experience of life and vitality.

I perceive the kind of psychotherapeutic work of which I speak as a form of intuitive creation of “representational interpretations”, as emphasized by the works of André Green (1984, 1986, 1999) and Sara and César Bottella (2005). These interpretations restart the process of creating representations that aided in the restoration of the thought processes of symbolization and mentalization, gradually opening spaces of thought in the treatment situation, eventually leading to the revival of the self and object. In this manner, the patient-therapist relationship shifts from a sadomasochistic bonding relationship to a real object-subject mode of relationship.

In the latter part of the essay, I describe the appearance of fissures in the perversion's structures that emerge due to the therapeutic situation, as evidenced by changes in the patient's mode of language. The discussion ends with a section entitled ‘Towards vitality, spontaneity and intimacy’, describing the kind of working-through that develops as signs of mental life begin to arise in the analytic space, as well as in the patient's psychic life.

**FROM THE PAINS OF SELF-ESTEEM
TO SELFHOOD AS COMPLETE EXISTENCE**

RUTH GAT-DUBROV

This paper deals with the experience of low and weakened self-esteem as expressed in different behaviors during the process of psychotherapy with children. By way of 4 clinical examples, I describe a therapeutic process stemming from the presence and stance of the therapist in the face of the different expression of emptying of and reduction in self-esteem, and through the constitutive moments of the strengthening and restoration of self-esteem within the therapeutic fabric. The restorative tie that takes place during the therapeutic process is bound by the transformation of the quality of consciousness of the parties immersed in it: both the therapist and the young patient are open and immersed as intertwined, asymmetrical vessels to each other.

My ideas lean on the theoretical and clinical conceptualizations of Self-Psychology. A significant theoretical contribution has been made by the Israeli group of Self-Psychology theorists and clinicians led by Raanan Kulka. In their view, self-esteem is a central and meaningful element in the structure of the cohesive and continuous self. The additional perspective in this paper is the dimension of selfhood. The experience of selfhood is a potential, subjective experience which goes beyond the structural form and not tied to it, enabling an open and mutual immersed experience between the self and other, person or elements of the world. The idea expressed in the paper outlines a platform that facilitates and constitutes the existence of whole selfhood which includes a self with stable and balanced self-esteem.

**THE FACES OF EVIL:
MANIFESTATIONS OF THE ARCHETYPAL SHADOW
IN MYTH AND PSYCHOTHERAPY**

ELANA LAKH

Since the beginning of time, evil has been a focus of human concern. Philosophers, theologians and many other disciplines, including moral theories, mythology and psychology, have tried to understand evil and define it within various theoretical frameworks. In psychotherapy as well, moral judgments based on the notion of evil are supposed to be withheld in order to prevent censorship and enable in-depth understanding of the psychic ingredients and tributaries of moral positions.

In the present work, I discuss evil and its manifestations within the human psyche, using the Carl Gustav Jung's (1875-1961) concept of the "Shadow". The individual's shadow represents the part of the personality that consists of all the tendencies that the developing ego considers unwanted and bad. On the collective level, Jung described the archetypal Shadow – the dark side of culture and of human nature, which is considered evil. Shadow is less a 'thing' than a point of view, defined by and shaped by the strictures of ego consciousness. But it is also an archetypal structure within the psyche, containing cultural images, values and ideas.

For Jung, knowing and owning one's Shadow dimension is a highly important moral imperative on the personal level as well as on the collective one. This is rendered practicable by the study of myths that offer an avenue for knowing the Shadow. Jungian tradition regards mythology as "a textbook of archetypes" (Jung 1988: 24), a source of psychological knowledge. Specifically, creation myths can be viewed as a form of developmental description because the story explains how things in the world came to be. A Jungian reading of creation myths revealed archetypal images portraying evil. These images embody psychic qualities that are considered to be evil by the consciousness that created the myth and as a way of externalizing these forces. Thus, myths describe evil as all forces that cause fear and suffering and pose a threat to human consciousness.

No single trait is considered evil in all myths; the same trait may be portrayed as evil in some myths but not in others, and even occasionally reappear as 'good.' Thus, the notion of evil and the contents of the Shadow are contingent on the values and the conscious attitude of the ego, and the regnant culture.

The values, as well as the archetypal tendency to value certain characteristics as evil, permeate psychotherapy as in all human interactions. Psychotherapeutic discourse tends to exclude the notion of evil, or to view evil as 'privatio boni' (St. Augustine, 1995), the absence of good, due to deprivation or hurt. Denying evil, and denying the archetypal evaluation of shadow attributes as evil, can actually cause a judgmental attitude towards the patient, if the therapist is unaware of the influence of her own Shadow. Acknowledgment and acquaintance with the therapist's Shadow as well as that of the patient enables us to take responsibility and work with the evil that we encounter within.

**WHEN BODY MEETS LANGUAGE:
ARAB-ISRAELI WOMEN TALK ABOUT INCEST,
A PSYCHOANALYTIC VIEW OF QUANTITATIVE RESEARCH**

OFRIT SHAPIRA-BERMAN and DOAA IBRAHIM

Our work is derived from psychoanalytic observation and analysis of semi-structured interviews that were conducted with 10 Arab-Israeli women, all victims of incest in childhood. Our observations reveal specific linguistic constructs through which the victims' traumatic experiences are being expressed. For example, the analysis highlighted the respondents' frequent transitions between Arabic, Hebrew and English, heavy use of plural first-person and third-person pronouns, reference to themselves' in masculine form, and multiple negations – all of which help tell the deeper story of intra-psychic, family and socio-political power constructs and multiple losses. Taken as a whole, the victims' metalanguage tells the profound story of the incest survivors' experience of multiple estrangement or exile – from their bodies, families, their mother tongue, subjectivity and community.

The linguistic constructs, and not only the content of the interviews as such, reveal and reflect not only this experience of imposed exile, but also the dynamics of the *covering*, *discovering* and *recovering*, the working-through of some of the most profound and traumatic experiences of these women. Their struggles and psychodynamics are discussed in light of the interrelationships between the *private* intrapsychic language of the subject and the *public* language of the collective, both saturated with cultural-patriarchal values. The authors suggest that socio-political and cultural-communal oppression is embodied in the oppression imposed by the abuser, and subsequently within the self-imposed intrapsychic oppression of the woman herself.

The findings are discussed based on a combination of psychoanalytic and psych-social perspectives, emphasizing the ways by which the personal intersects with the socio-political; the personal trauma is reinforced by the collective trauma of living as a socio-political minority. As one of the women interviewed remarked, "If ever again anyone will say that there is no such

thing as incest in the Arab society, I will send them to the library of the Hebrew University, to read this research!”

**THE TOWER OF BABEL:
FROM TRIBAL BONFIRE TO THE MELTING POT
AND BACK**

TUVIA PERI, MITCHEL BECKER, and BOAZ SHALGI

The biblical story of the Tower of Babel in *Genesis* has received many interpretations, from the midrashim of ancient sages to those of modern biblical scholars. In psychoanalytic literature as well, this enigmatic story has received diverse interpretations. The authors suggest a developmental reading of the story, seeing it as the story of a post-traumatic society that seeks to secure its future through a particular form of group formation and the pursuit of knowledge. This movement, the authors contend, begins as a fundamentally healthy and developmental process, but gradually becomes pathological in its striving for idealization and perfection – perfect confidence, perfect knowledge, and a sense of a perfect whole that lacks nothing. Once retreating to and becoming enslaved by the narcissistic fantasy and state of omniscience, society loses the crucial capacity to doubt and contend with uncertainty. In this manner, the ability to learn, develop, relate, and meet the other as an individual subject with an inherent difference is lost. From here the way to an utter loss of meaningful communication and basic social integration is short. The essay makes use of W. R. Bion's own brief but pithy reading of the Babel story and his theoretical conceptualizations, along with Michael Eigen's interpretation of Bion's work regarding the tension between knowing and not knowing, and between unity and multiplicity. Finally, the authors use the implications of psychoanalytic insights derived from the biblical myth in order to discuss the 'babel' of psychoanalytic theories and their implication for acknowledging the limitations of our knowledge in the therapeutic encounter.

**AS ENQUIST AND BACH MEET OGDEN:
WORDS AND SOUNDS IN REVERIE'S WANDERING
AS PROCESSES OF COPING WITH LOSS AND
MOURNING IN ART**

NURIT DOROB-BAR

In this article I fashion a link between Dutch psychoanalyst Anna Enquist's (the pen name of Christa Widlund-Broer) book *Contrapunct* (2008), Johann Sebastian Bach's musical composition "Goldberg Variations" and Thomas H. Ogden's concept of "reverie". Enquist – pianist, novelist and poet – and Bach, though separated by centuries, were both well-known artists in their fields who struggled to cope with the tragic death of a child and created these pieces following their experience of loss. I demonstrate here how the reveries which accompanied the writing and composition work, enabled Enquist and Bach each to create one of the most significant pieces of their creative lives. My assumption is that it is the reverie process that permitted Enquist and Bach to get close and touch their deep pain which assisted them to mourn the loss of their most precious child. Concepts such as "acoustic reverie" and "the mourning art of reading", which I elaborate upon and develop, help me to explain the way in which words and sounds play out for the artists, and may contribute to the development of unique and valuable reverie. When truly successful, the author – writer, musician, or psychoanalyst – recreates this form of reverie in the reader's or listener's mind as well.

In the latter part of my essay I link these reverie moments, which allow the writer to touch upon diverse and difficult emotions, to the reverie moments that psychotherapists experience with their patients, both inside and outside the clinic, as part of their adaptation to painful moments of potential creativity. These moments can also be significant in mourning art. The connections I draw may enrich and deepen the observation and understanding of 'moments of reverie' in the therapeutic work that seem sometimes to have been blocked or lost, and to the work with grief that has been repressed or frozen, its representations lost along the way. The purpose of this article is to illustrate

how these unique reveries that may be evoked by a single word or a musical note, may create mental movement and act as vitalizing and transformative factors in therapeutic work.